

# Journal of medical ethics

## The Journal of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

The *Journal of Medical Ethics* has been established, with a multi-disciplinary Editorial Board, to promote the study of contemporary medico-moral problems. The Editorial Board has as its aims the encouragement of a high academic standard for this developing subject and the influencing of the quality of both professional and public discussion. The *Journal* is published quarterly.

The *Journal* includes papers on all aspects of medical ethics, analyses ethical concepts and theories and features case conferences and comment on clinical practice. It includes book reviews and details of lectures and symposia on issues raised by the practice of medicine.

### Editorial Board

#### EDITOR:

*Raanan Gillon*, BA (Philosophy), MB, BS, MRCP, Assistant Director, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics.

#### CONSULTING EDITORS:

*A S Duncan*, Emeritus Professor of Medical Education, University of Edinburgh.

*C M Fletcher*, Emeritus Professor of Clinical Epidemiology, University of London.

#### EDITORIAL BOARD:

*R B Welbourn* (Chairman), Professor of Surgical Endocrinology, Royal Postgraduate Medical School, London.

*K M Boyd*, Scottish Director, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

*R D Catterall*, Consultant Venereologist, Middlesex Hospital, London.

*Robin Downie*, Professor of Moral Philosophy, University of Glasgow.

*G R Dunstan*, Professor of Moral and Social Theology, King's College, London.

*Michael F Green*, Consultant Physician, The Royal Free Hospital, London.

*Roger Higgs*, General Practitioner, London.

*Gerard J Hughes SJ*, Department of Philosophy, Heythrop College, London.

*Ian Kennedy*, Faculty of Law, King's College, London.

*Marshall Marinker*, Professor of Community Medicine, University of Leicester.

*Raymond Plant*, Professor of Politics, University of Southampton.

*Sir Martin Roth*, Professor of Psychiatry, University of Cambridge.

*Rt Hon Lord Justice Shaw*, Lord Justice of Appeal

*Margaret Stacey*, Professor of Sociology, University of Warwick.

*Eric Wilkes*, Professor of Community Care and General Practice, University of Sheffield.

*Edward Shotton*, Director of Studies, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, *ex officio*.

#### TECHNICAL EDITOR:

*Dorothy Mitchell Smith*, Edinburgh.

## Contents

### Editorial

Ordinary and extraordinary means 55

### Focus

The wrong doctors: selection or training at fault?

*Alison Munro* 57

Commentary *Bruce MacGillivray* 59

### Main articles

Learning about death: a project report from the Edinburgh University Medical School

*Ian E Thompson, C P Lowther, Derek Doyle, Jeremy Bird and Jane Turnbull* 62

Ethical aspects of clinical decision-making  
*I Kollemorten, C Strandberg,*

*B M Thomsen et al* 67

Students' attitudes to ethics in the medical school curriculum

*Earl E Shelp, Michael L Russell and Nellie Grose* 70

### Debate

Extraordinary means and the sanctity of life  
*Helga Kuhse*

74

Commentary *Gerard J Hughes SJ* 79

Response *Helga Kuhse* 81

Can fluids and electrolytes be 'extraordinary' treatment?

*Carson Strong* 83

The fragmented man

*Margaret Blackwood* 86

### Words

Dignity and medical procedures

*Alexander McCall Smith* 88

### The parliamentary scene

Medical responsibilities in the Third World

*Tony Smith* 91

### Case conference

How do we teach medical ethics? 92

Book reviews 95

Thematic review of past issues 103

News and notes 110

Correspondence 111

Medical groups 112

# Journal of medical ethics

## Submitting manuscripts for publication

Papers submitted for publication should be sent in duplicate to: The Editor, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG. Rejected manuscripts are not returned unless accompanied by a stamped addressed envelope, or international reply coupon. Papers should be in double-spaced typewriting on one side of the paper only. The corresponding author's name and address should appear on the first page. Authors should also submit an *interesting* abstract with their papers. On a separate sheet a brief entry for 'Contributors to this issue' should be supplied, containing the title of the author's present post, degrees and/or professional qualifications, and any other relevant information. Abbreviations should be avoided except for those in general use. The names of journals, organisations etc., should be given in full.

As from the beginning of Volume 7 (March 1981) *JME* has adopted a simplified 'Vancouver style' for references: details are given in *JME*, December 1980, p 214 and are also available from the editorial office. As the 'Vancouver style' is incompatible with the long established style of references for legal articles, lawyers should use their own standard style, but avoid abbreviations so as to facilitate reference by others. The *Journal* is multidisciplinary and papers should be in clear English, accessible to any intelligent reader.

Four copies of the *Journal* will be sent to authors free of charge after their papers are published. Offprints of individual papers may be bought from The Publisher, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

## Notice to subscribers

The *Journal of medical ethics* is published quarterly. The annual subscription rates are £16.00 in the United Kingdom and Irish Republic, and US \$40.00 in all countries overseas. Payment for overseas subscriptions should be made in dollars, ie, US \$40.00, or in your national currency based on the prevailing exchange rate to the US dollar of that currency, payable to Professional and Scientific Publications/JME A/c. Orders can also be placed locally with any leading subscription agent or bookseller. (For the convenience of readers in the USA subscription orders, with or without payment, can also be sent to: Professional and Scientific Publications, 1172 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Mass. 02134. All enquiries, however, must be addressed to the Publisher in London). All enquiries regarding Air Mail rates, single copies, advertisements, etc. should be sent to: The Publisher, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

ISSN 0306-6800

Copyright © 1981 *Journal of medical ethics*. All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the *Journal of medical ethics*.

# Contributors to this issue

**Jeremy Bird** is a medical student at the University of Edinburgh Medical School

**Margaret Blackwood** is President of Disablement Income Group (DIG) Scotland and is also a trustee of the Margaret Blackwood Housing Association

**Derek Doyle** is Medical Director at St Columba's Hospice, Edinburgh

**Nellie Grose** is Assistant Professor of Family Medicine and Director of Education, Department of Family Medicine, Baylor College of Medicine

**Gerard Hughes SJ** Head of Department of Philosophy, Heythrop College, University of London but is at present with the Jesuit Community, Georgetown University, Washington DC, USA.

**Helga Kuhse** is Research Fellow with the Monash Centre for Human Bioethics

**C P Lowther** is Consultant Physician, Royal Victoria Hospital, Edinburgh

**Alexander McCall Smith** is a lecturer, Department of Civil Law, University of Edinburgh

**Bruce MacGillivray** is Dean, Royal Free Hospital School of Medicine, London

**Alison Munro** is Chairman of the Merton, Sutton and Wandsworth Area Health Authority (Teaching).

**P Riis**, corresponding author for 'Ethical aspects of clinical decision-making,' is Physician-in-chief, Professor of Internal Medicine, University of Copenhagen, Denmark

**Michael L Russell** is Assistant Professor, Departments of Community Medicine and Psychiatry, Baylor College of Medicine

**Earl E Shelp** is Assistant Professor of Ethics, and Coordinator, Program in Ethics, Department of Community Medicine, Baylor College of Medicine

**Carson Strong** is Assistant Professor with the Program on Human Values and Ethics, University of Tennessee Center for Health Sciences, Memphis

**Ian E Thompson** is a Research Fellow to the Edinburgh Medical Group's project in Medical Ethics and Education, University of Edinburgh

**Jane Turnbull** is a medical student at the University of Edinburgh Medical School.

*American correspondent*

Bernard Towers, Department of Pediatrics, University of California at Los Angeles

*Case conference editor*

Roger Higgs, 81 Brixton Water Lane, London SW2 1PH

## Thematic review and index

The thematic review of past issues appears in the June issue each year and an index to each volume appears in the December issue.

## Thematic review of past issues

### Volumes 1-7/1 (April 1975-March 1981 inclusive)

As a service to our readers we are continuing to publish annually, a compilation under thematic headings of articles which have appeared in the *Journal* since its inception in April 1975. Although we already publish at the end of each Volume (December issue) an Index for that Volume it is felt that this sort of list would allow new readers to see at a glance the range of topics covered so far. Some articles may have been omitted from this present list but are likely to appear in later issues as the scope of the articles published in this *Journal* widens. Our aim has been to show the main themes so far covered.

Readers will also appreciate that in some cases articles could easily have been classified differently. We have classified the articles into very broad categories which cannot always do justice to every aspect of their content.

### Abortion and sterilisation

1975 VOLUME 1/1  
*Case conference:* Abortion and sterilisation  
Sir Dugald Baird, Hugh MacLaren and J E Roberts  
*Commentary*—Raymond Plant

VOLUME 1/3  
*Editorial:* The abortion issue

*Main articles:* Induced abortion: epidemiological aspects  
Sir Dugald Baird  
*Main article:* A new ethical approach to abortion and its implications for the euthanasia dispute  
R F R Gardner

VOLUME 1/4  
*Editorial:* Sterilisation  
*Focus:* Child sterilisation  
BBC Discussion

1976 VOLUME 2/1  
*Main article:* Issues of public policy in the USA raised by amniocentesis  
Amitai Etzioni

VOLUME 2/3  
*Main article:* Congenital abnormalities and selective abortion  
Mary J Seller

1977 VOLUME 3/2  
*The parliamentary scene:* The Abortion (Amendment) Bill  
Tony Smith

1978 VOLUME 4/1  
*Main article:* Sterilisation: The Aberdeen experience and some broader implications  
Sue Teper  
*Main article:* Recent and possible future trends in abortion  
François Lafitte

VOLUME 4/2  
*The parliamentary scene:* Abortion and pregnancy screening

1979 VOLUME 5/3  
*Main article:* Self-ownership, abortion and infanticide  
Ellen Frankel Paul and Jeffrey Paul  
*Commentary:* Gerard J Hughes SJ

VOLUME 5/4  
*Report from America:* The trials of Dr Waddill  
Bernard Towers  
*The parliamentary scene:* Abortion (Amendment) Bill  
Tony Smith

1980 VOLUME 6/1  
*Main article:* The Marquis de Sade and induced abortion  
A D Farr  
*The parliamentary scene:* The Abortion Bill in committee  
Tony Smith

### Artificial insemination

1975 VOLUME 1/1  
*Main article:* Donor insemination  
M G Kerr and Carol Rogers  
*Main article:* Problems of selecting donors for artificial insemination  
R Schoysman  
*Main article:* Cryobanking of human sperm  
Max S Frankel  
*Main article:* AID and the Law  
D J Cusine  
*Main article:* Ethical aspects of donor insemination  
G R Dunstan

- VOLUME 1/2  
*Focus: Our future inheritance*  
R V Short
- 1977 VOLUME 3/4  
*Main article: Artificial insemination with the husband's semen after death*  
D J Cusine
- 1978 VOLUME 4/2  
*Case conference: Lesbian couples: should help extend to AID?*
- VOLUME 4/4  
*Report from America: Louise Brown—a storm in a petri dish*  
Bernard Towers

### Clinical research

- 1975 VOLUME 1/1  
*Main article: The composition and function of ethical committees*  
William W May
- VOLUME 1/3  
*Main article: Some observations on informed consent in non-therapeutic research*  
J C Garnham
- VOLUME 1/4  
*Main article: The inherent paradox of clinical trials in psychiatry*  
H Helmchen and B Muller-Oerlinghausen  
*Main article: The ethics of clinical trials*  
J K Wing
- 1977 VOLUME 3/1  
*Main article: Ethical problems of repetitive research*  
Report of a working party
- 1978 VOLUME 4/2  
*Main article: Testing new drugs—the human volunteer*  
Duncan Vere

- VOLUME 4/4  
*Main article: Problems in deceptive medical procedures: an ethical and legal analysis of the administration of placebos*  
Beth Simmons
- 1979 VOLUME 5/1  
*Main article: A follow-up neurobiological study: why volunteer?*  
Jane S Sturges, Donald R Sweeney and David Pickar
- 1980 VOLUME 6/2  
*Editorial: Ethics, surgery and clinical research*  
*Main article: Ethics and randomised clinical trials*  
Gustav Giertz  
*Main article: World Health Organisation biomedical research guidelines and the conduct of clinical trials*  
Withold Rudowski  
*Main article: Taboos and clinical research in West Africa*  
O O Ajayi
- VOLUME 6/3  
*Main article: Biological aspects of homosexuality*  
Malcolm MacCulloch

- 1981 VOLUME 7/1  
*Editorial: Huntington's chorea*  
*Main article: Ethical aspects of plans to combat Huntington's chorea*  
C J Brackenridge
- VOLUME 7/1  
*Main article: Medical experiments on human beings*  
Bernard Towers

### Death and euthanasia

- 1975 VOLUME 1/1  
*Editorial: Euthanasia*  
*Main article: Should the patient be allowed to die?*  
Richard Nicholson
- 1976 VOLUME 2/1  
*Focus: The Karen Quinlan case*  
Ian Kennedy

- VOLUME 2/4  
*Main article: The case for a statutory 'definition of death'*  
P D G Skegg
- 1977 VOLUME 3/1  
*Editorial: On dying and dying well*  
*Focus: Diagnosis of brain death*  
Bryan Jennett  
*Focus: The definition of death*  
Ian Kennedy  
*Main article: Attitudes towards euthanasia*  
Carolyn Winget, Frederic T Kapp and Roselee C Yeaworth
- VOLUME 3/2  
*Focus: On dying and dying well: Extracts from the Edwin Stevens lecture*  
Donald Coggan  
*Case conference: Death my only love*
- VOLUME 3/3  
*Main article: Attitudes to death: some historical notes*  
Kenneth Boyd
- Analysis: The right to live*  
D Hostler
- VOLUME 3/4  
*Case conference: Officially to keep alive*
- 1978 VOLUME 4/1  
*Main article: Fetal survival—who decides?*  
Iain R McFadyen
- VOLUME 4/2  
*Report from America: The impact of the California Natural Death Act*  
Bernard Towers
- VOLUME 4/3  
*Case conference: After the first death there is no other*
- VOLUME 4/4  
*Main article: Dying while living: a critique of allowing-to-die legislation*  
Marc Lappé

1979 VOLUME 5/2  
*Main article:* Deciding the care of severely malformed or dying infants

A G M Campbell and  
 R S Duff

*Main article:* Learning about death

Una MacLean

*Main article:* The faces of death

G Popa and Ecaterina Hanganu

VOLUME 5/3

*Debate:* Selective non-treatment of newborns  
 Richard Sherlock

*Response:* A G M Campbell and R S Duff

VOLUME 5/4

*Main article:* Killing, letting die and euthanasia  
 Douglas N Husak

1980 VOLUME 6/2

*Main article:* The right to die and the chance to live  
 Jonathan E Rhoads

*Report from America:* A television triumph about death and dying  
 Bernard Towers

VOLUME 6/4

*Editorial:* Who shall die?

1981 VOLUME 7/1

*Focus:* On the death of a baby

Robert and Peggy Stinson

*Commentary 1:* R B Zachary

*Commentary 2:* A G M

Campbell and D J Cusine

*Debate:* Even dying must be edited: further thoughts on

Joan Robinson

Stephen Curry, Arthur

Zucker and Joanne

Trautmann

*Response:* Bernard Towers

## Disputes in the Health Services

1976 VOLUME 2/1

*Editorial:* Industrial action by doctors

1977 VOLUME 3/2

*Editorial:* Strikes in the NHS

*Main article:* Strikes and the National Health Service: some legal and ethical issues

Gerald Dworkin

*Commentary—*Peter Zacharias

*The parliamentary scene:* Coming battles

VOLUME 3/3

The Royal College of Nursing (Rcn) code of conduct

*Commentary—*J D Dawson,

A T Altschul, Chris

Sampson and Alexander

McCall Smith

1978 VOLUME 4/1

*The parliamentary scene:* Why doctors cause politicians trouble  
 Tony Smith

1979 VOLUME 5/2

*Editorial:* More struck against than striking

*The parliamentary scene:* Strikes by NHS workers  
 Tony Smith

VOLUME 5/4

*Main article:* The incentive argument for the unionisation of medical workers

Terrance C McConnell

1981 VOLUME 7/1

*Main article:* Consultants rule OK? the changing pattern of medical hierarchy  
 N F Coghill

## Doctor/patient relationship

1975 VOLUME 1/1

*Main article:*

Communication with the dying

J M Wilson

*Commentary—*C M Fletcher

*Analysis:* Determinism  
 R S Downie

VOLUME 1/2

*Main article:* Not quite what the patient ordered  
 Katherine Whitehorn

VOLUME 1/3

*Analysis:* 'Is' and 'ought'  
 Patrick MacGrath

VOLUME 1/4

*Main article:* Homosexuality and the medical profession—a behaviourist's view

John Bancroft

*Analysis:* Authority

C H Lesser

1976 VOLUME 2/1

*Commentary* on John Bancroft's article 'Homosexuality and the medical profession—a behaviourist's view'  
 Ruth A Schrock and Ian C Dunn

John Bancroft replies  
*Case conference:* Limits of confidentiality

VOLUME 2/2

*Main article:* Interdisciplinary teamwork  
 M de Wachter

*Main article:* Some problems of confidentiality in medical computing  
 Barry Barber, R D Cohen, D J Kenny, J Rowson and Maureen Scholes

VOLUME 2/4

*Main article:* Medical practice: Defendants and prisoners  
 Paul Bowden

*Main article:* Is geriatrics the answer to the problem of old age?

I P H Millard

II Brice Pitt

III David Hobman

*Case conference:* Retreat from death?

- 1977 VOLUME 3/3  
*Main article:* False belief and the refusal of medical treatment  
 Ruth and Alan Faden  
*Case conference:* Changing direction in general practice

VOLUME 3/4  
*Main article:* Privacy, confidentiality and automated health information systems  
 H Vouri

- 1978 VOLUME 4/1  
*Case conference:* Conflict of loyalties—Hippocratic or hypocritical

VOLUME 4/4  
*Case conference:* Fain would I change that note

- 1979 VOLUME 5/1  
*Point of view:* More blessed to receive?  
 Anthony R Moore

VOLUME 5/2  
*Main article:* The nature of confidentiality  
 Ian E Thompson

VOLUME 5/3  
*Editorial:* BMA Ethical Handbook  
*Case conference:* 'There's naught but Care on ev'ry han'

- 1980 VOLUME 6/1  
*Main article:* The role of the doctor: technician or statesman?  
 R F Stalley

VOLUME 6/2  
*Editorial:* The transsexual dilemma  
*Main article:* Limitations of the surgical contract  
 Folke Nilsson  
*Main article:* The delegation of surgical responsibility  
 John Cook  
*Main article:* The transsexual dilemma: being a transsexual  
 Nicholas Mason

*Main article:*  
 Transsexualism: a medical perspective  
 C N Armstrong  
*Main article:*  
 Transsexualism: a legal perspective  
 Joseph M Thomson

VOLUME 6/3  
*Main article:*  
 Homosexuality and freedom of speech  
 R D Catterall

VOLUME 6/4  
*Focus:* Triage and the patient with renal failure  
 V Parsons and P Lock  
*Main article:* The hands of the healer: has faith a place?  
 Gaius Davies  
*The parliamentary scene:*  
 Complaints and clinical judgment  
 Tony Smith

- 1981 VOLUME 7/1  
*Case conference:* Where's there's no will there's no way

## Drugs

- 1975 VOLUME 1/1  
*Main article:* The use of narcotic analgesics in terminal illness  
 R G Twycross

VOLUME 1/3  
*Main article:*  
 Self-medication with mood-changing drugs  
 D G Grahame-Smith

- 1976 VOLUME 2/2  
*Main article:* What is barbiturate dependence and who is at risk?  
 Philip H Connell  
*Main article:* Barbiturate abuse  
 P T d'Orban  
*Main article:* The moral choice in prescribed barbiturates  
 Frank Wells  
*Case conference:*  
 Volunteers at risk

VOLUME 2/3  
*Main article:* 'Side' effects—a misnomer  
 C R B Joyce  
*Case conference:* 'The soft embalmer of the still midnight'. A problem of prescribing hypnotics in general practice.

- 1977 VOLUME 3/1  
*Editorial:* Physician heal thyself  
*Main article:* Do drug advertisements provide therapeutic information?  
 Gerry Stimson

## Medical ethics definitions and discussions

- 1975 VOLUME 1/1  
*Main article:* Ethics and the professions  
 Lord Kilbrandon, P D Nutall and Zofia Butrym

VOLUME 1/4  
*Main article:* Nursing ethics in the USA  
 Martin Bunzl

- 1976 VOLUME 2/1  
*Main article:* Is a moral consensus in medical ethics possible?  
 Basil Mitchell  
*Analysis:* Natural law  
 Gerard J Hughes SJ  
*The parliamentary scene:*  
 Medical ethics in the House of Lords  
 Tony Smith  
 The literature of medical ethics—a review of the writings of Hans Jonas  
 F B K Cooper

VOLUME 2/2  
*Main article:* Implications of medical ethics for ethics in general  
 Ian E Thompson  
*Analysis:* Morality and religion  
 Ronald Hepburn

- 1977 VOLUME 3/1  
*Main article:* The implications of medical ethics  
 Amnon Goldworth and Ian E Thompson

## VOLUME 3/2

*Editorial:* Is medical ethics a speciality?

*Main article:* The literature of medical ethics: Bernard Haring  
Brendan Soane

## VOLUME 3/3

*Main article:* Tacit components of medical ethics: Making decisions in the clinic  
Larry R Churchill

## VOLUME 3/4

*Editorial:* Indexing ethics  
*Analysis:* Definitions and ethical decisions  
D D Clarke and D M Clarke

## 1978 VOLUME 4/4

*Main article:* A clinical model for decision-making  
Richard M Martin

## 1979 VOLUME 5/2

*Focus:* Law and medical ethics  
David A Frenkel  
*Case conference:* When doctors disagree

## VOLUME 5/3

*Analysis:* Acts and omissions  
Colin Honey

## 1980 VOLUME 6/1

*Main article:* The ethical force of definitions  
Douglas N Walton  
*Main article:* Special features of general practice (primary care) and ethical implications  
John Fry  
*Words:* Ethics, morals and moral philosophy  
R S Downie

## VOLUME 6/2

*Main article:* Moral and ethical issues in geriatric surgery  
R Reiss  
*Main article:* Closing remarks on ethical problems in surgical practice

## Lord Smith of Marlow

*Main article:* Ethical dilemmas in surgery: some philosophical reflections  
Michael Lockwood

## VOLUME 6/3

*Editorial:* Good television—indifferent ethics  
*Main article:* Attitudes to medical ethics among British Muslim medical practitioners  
Aminah Molloy

## VOLUME 6/4

*Main article:* Cost-benefit analysis and medical ethics  
Gavin H Mooney  
*Main article:* The concept of 'competence' in medical ethics  
Elias Baumgarten  
*Main article:* A philosophy of a clinically based medical ethics  
David C Thomasma  
*Main article:* A note on ethics and the part-timer in occupational health  
K V Kuenssberg

## Medicine and society

## 1975 VOLUME 1/2

*Main article:* The medicalisation of life  
Ivan Illich  
*Main article:* Clinical damage, medical monopoly, the expropriation of health: Three dimensions of iatrogenic tort  
Ivan Illich  
*Main article:* Why make people patients?  
Marshall Marinker  
*Main article:* Society's expectations of health  
Edmund Leach  
*Analysis:* The greatest happiness  
Raymond Plant

## VOLUME 1/3

*Case conference:* The limits of informed consent

## VOLUME 1/4

*Editorial:* The cost of saving life  
*Case conference:* Does the end result justify the expense?

## 1976 VOLUME 2/2

*Report from America:* A long hard look at medicine  
Bernard Towers

## VOLUME 2/3

*Editorial:* Ethics and priorities  
*Main article:* Justice, wealth and health care  
Elizabeth Telfer  
*Analysis:* Liberty  
Hillel Steiner  
*The parliamentary scene:* Private beds and clinical judgment  
Tony Smith

## VOLUME 2/4

*Main article:* The place of medicine in the American prison—ethical issues in the treatment of offenders  
Peter L Sissons  
*Main article:* Dilemmas of medical ethics in the Canadian Penitentiary Service  
Chuni Roy  
*Main article:* The just provision of health care—a reply to Elizabeth Telfer  
Hillel Steiner

## 1977 VOLUME 3/1

*Analysis:* Dignity  
Elizabeth MacLaren

## VOLUME 3/2

*Analysis:* Conscience  
Eric D'Arcy

## VOLUME 3/4

*Main article:* Human rights  
Enoch Powell  
*Commentary*—R S Downie  
*Main article:* Gifts, exchanges and the political economy of health care  
Part 1—Should blood be bought and sold?  
Raymond Plant

1978 VOLUME 4/1  
*Main article:* Gifts, exchanges, and the political economy of health care  
 Part 11—How should health care be distributed?  
 Raymond Plant

VOLUME 4/2  
*Focus:* The 'no lose' philosophy in medicine  
 S Galbraith

VOLUME 4/4  
*Focus:* Human rights and distributive justice in health care delivery  
 Robert L Shelton

1979 VOLUME 5/1  
*Main article:* What is medicine?: towards a philosophical approach  
 David Greaves

VOLUME 5/2  
*Main article:* Choosing priorities  
 J A Muir Gray

VOLUME 5/4  
*Main article:* Statistical lives and the principle of maximum benefit  
 Albert Weale  
*Main article:* Informed consent: theory and policy  
 Carson Strong

1980 VOLUME 6/1  
*Editorial:* Torture and philosophy

*Focus:* Self-help in health care  
 David Robinson  
*Main article:* On the permissibility of torture  
 Gary E Jones

VOLUME 6/3  
*Editorial:* Surgery for the mind  
*Main article:* Doctors and torture: the police surgeon  
 Stanley H Burges  
*Main article:* Doctors and torture: an experience as a prisoner  
 Alfredo Jadresic

*Letter from Australia:*  
 Coming of age  
 Anthony R Moore

VOLUME 6/4  
*Case conference:* A solitary mister  
*Report from America:* The extent of public interest in medical-ethical legal problems  
 Bernard Towers

1981 VOLUME 7/1  
*Editorial:* The 1980 Reith Lectures

### Organ transplantation

1975 VOLUME 1/2  
*Main article:*  
 Transplantation  
 R Y Calne  
*Main article:* Tissue for transplantation  
 Tam Dalyell MP  
*Main article:* The donor doctor's dilemma  
 Bryan Jennett  
*Main article:* Ethical aspects of donor consent in transplantation  
 John Mahoney  
*Main article:*  
 Transplantation: the relatives' view  
 Priscilla Demetrius and the parents of John

1979 VOLUME 5/1  
*Main article:* The donation and transplantation of kidneys: should the law be changed?  
 Ian Kennedy

VOLUME 5/4  
*Debate:* Let's not opt out: kidney donation and transplantation  
 Robert A Sells

1980 VOLUME 6/1  
*Debate:* Kidney transplants: a reply to Sells  
 Ian Kennedy

### Pain

1977 VOLUME 3/2  
*Main article:* Patients with protracted pain: a survey conducted at a London Hospital  
 Jennifer M Hunt, Thelma D Stollar, David W Littlejohns, Robert G Twycross, Duncan W Vere

1978 VOLUME 4/3  
*Editorial:* Facing pain  
*Main article:* The assessment of pain in advanced cancer  
 Robert G Twycross  
*Main article:* The value of clinics for the relief of chronic pain  
 Mark Swerdlow  
*Main article:* Pain in childbirth  
 Sheila Kitzinger  
*Main article:* The place of pain in human experience  
 Gilbert Lewis

1980 VOLUME 6/2  
*Focus:* The hospital as a place of pain  
 D W Vere

### Psychiatry, ethics and mental health

1976 VOLUME 2/3  
*Main article:* Exorcism: psychiatric viewpoint  
 W H Trethowan

VOLUME 2/4  
*Focus:* The care of the mentally abnormal offender and the protection of the public  
 Henry R Rollin  
*Focus:* The concept of dangerousness  
 Alan Norton

1977 VOLUME 3/1  
*Editorial:* Where are the promised secure units for the mentally ill?



- 1978 VOLUME 4/2  
*Editorial:* Psychiatry, ethics and political intimidation  
 Declaration of Hawaii  
*Commentary*—Clarence DD Blomquist  
*Main article:* Political neutrality and international cooperation in medicine  
 H Merskey  
*Analysis:* Mental disease  
 Antony Flew

VOLUME 4/3  
*Main article:* Psychiatry as ideology in the USSR  
 Sidney Bloch

- 1980 VOLUME 6/1  
*Case conference:* A volunteer by family choice

VOLUME 6/2  
*Case conference:* Hallelujah, I'm a bum: a story from the post-Christian era

VOLUME 6/3  
*Main article:* Psychosocial aspects of homosexuality  
 Sidney Crown  
*Main article:* Ethical considerations of psychosurgery: the unhappy legacy of the pre-frontal lobotomy  
 Larry O Gostin  
*Commentary:* P K Bridges

- 1981 VOLUME 7/1  
*Words:* Mental illness  
 Roger Scruton

### Teaching medical ethics

- 1975 VOLUME 1/2  
*Editorial:* Teaching medical ethics  
*Main article:* Teaching medical ethics in Sweden and USA  
 Clarence Blomquist, Robert M Veatch and Diane Fenner

VOLUME 1/3  
*Main article:* The teaching of medical ethics in Maastricht, The Netherlands  
 Paul Sporken

- 1976 VOLUME 2/2  
*Main article:* The teaching of medical ethics in the Nottingham Medical School  
 J S P Jones and D H H Metcalfe

- 1977 VOLUME 3/4  
*Main article:* The teaching of medical ethics at Southampton University Medical School  
 K J Dennis and M R P Hall

- 1978 VOLUME 4/1  
*Main article:* The teaching of medical ethics: University College, Cork, Ireland  
 Dolores Dooley Clarke

VOLUME 4/2  
*Main article:* The teaching of medical ethics: University of Nijmegen, Netherlands  
 Maurice De Wachter

VOLUME 4/3  
*Main article:* The teaching of medical ethics: University of Edinburgh  
 Kenneth Boyd, Colin Currie, Alison Tierney and Ian E Thompson

- 1979 VOLUME 5/2  
*Main article:* Teaching medical ethics in the Federal Republic of Germany  
 Eduard Seidler

VOLUME 5/4  
*Main article:* Teaching medical ethics: the

cognitive-developmental approach  
 Stephen A Goldman and Jack Arbuthnot  
*Commentary:* Raanan Gillon

- 1980 VOLUME 6/1  
*Debate:* Philosophy and teaching medical ethics  
 Jack Arbuthnot

VOLUME 6/2  
*Main article:* Teaching medical ethics: Ljubljana school of medicine, Yugoslavia  
 Janez Milcinski and Stefan Straziscar  
*Case conference:* As the buds so the flowers: a discussion of medical education

### Violence

- 1979 VOLUME 5/3  
*Editorial:* An end to violence?  
*Main article:* The origins of violence  
 H J Eysenck  
*Main article:* The natural history of violence  
 Claire and W M S Russell  
*Main article:* The general practitioner and the problems of battered women  
 Jan Pahl  
*Main article:* Coping with the violent patient in accident and emergency  
 Sylvia Winterbottom  
*Main article:* The response to violence  
 D J West  
*Main article:* Violence: a summary  
 Conor Cruise O'Brien

---

## News and notes

---

### **Medical Campaign Against Nuclear Weapons**

A medical campaign against nuclear weapons has been started by a group of doctors in Britain. As persons involved in health care they are convinced that the prevention of nuclear war offers the only possibility of protecting people from its medical consequences. Their main aims are summarised as follows:

- a) To keep under review available information on the medical implications of nuclear weapons, nuclear war and related subjects.
- b) To act as a reference agency for information on these matters.
- c) To provide information by lectures, publications and other means to the medical and related professions and to the public.
- d) To bring to the attention of all concerned with public policy the medical implications of nuclear weapons.
- e) To seek the cooperation of the medical and related professions in all countries for these aims.

The present office-bearers are Professor John Humphrey FRS (Chairman), Dr Jack Fielding FRCP (Vice-Chairman), Dr Nini Ettlinger (Treasurer) and Claire Ryle (National organiser). This

national organising committee will coordinate regional activities. For details concerning membership please contact: MCANW 120 Edith Road, London W14. For any other information please contact Claire Ryle by telephone - 061-832 3709.

### **Workshop on Applied and Professional Ethics**

This Workshop sponsored by The Hastings Center is being held from 5-11 July 1981 at Colorado College, Colorado Springs. One of the main purposes of the Workshop is to bring together, both formally and informally, people who are concerned to explore some major problems of applied and professional ethics.

The Workshop will be organised in such a way that occasions will be provided:

- a) for some common selected problems to be discussed by the participants as a whole, and
- b) for those with an interest in particular professions to spend time together working on problems within their profession or area of interest.

Anyone with a serious interest in applied and professional ethics

is eligible to join this Workshop. For further details and application forms please contact: Workshop on Applied and Professional Ethics, The Hastings Center, 360 Broadway, Hastings-on-Hudson, New York 10706, USA.

### **1st International Congress on Nursing Law and Ethics**

From 13-18 June 1982 at the Jerusalem Hilton Hotel the above Congress will meet to discuss the legal and ethical aspects of the nursing practice. The main topics include Education, Licensing and employment, Nursing laws, Nursing ethics, Nurse and the patient, Nurse and the staff, Practice and malpractice, Patients of various cultures and religions and Administration and organisation.

The Congress is being organised jointly by The National Association of Nurses in Israel, The Israel Medical Association and The Society for Medicine and Law in Israel. For further information please contact: The Secretariat, 1st International Congress on Nursing and Ethics, P O Box 29784, Tel Aviv, Israel.

---

## Medical groups

---

### Further information on Medical Groups

Further details and complete lecture lists are available from the secretaries of the medical groups listed below. Please enclose a stamped addressed A4 envelope.

**ABERDEEN MEDICAL GROUP**  
Dr James Hendry, Medical Buildings, Foresterhill, Aberdeen AB9 22D

**BIRMINGHAM MEDICAL GROUP**  
Dr Anthony Parsons, Department of Obstetrics, Birmingham Maternity Hospital, Edgbaston. Birmingham B15

**BRISTOL MEDICAL GROUP**  
Dr Martin London, 11 Somerset Street, Kingsdown, Bristol BS2 8NB

**CAMBRIDGE MEDICAL GROUP**  
Mr Patrick Doyle, Department of Urology, Addenbrooke's Hospital, Hill's Road, Cambridge

**CARDIFF MEDICAL GROUP**  
Dr Jonathan Richards, 10 St Fagan's Rise, Fairwater, Cardiff

**DUNDEE MEDICAL GROUP**  
Dr Douglas Shaw, Department of Pharmacology and Therapeutics, University of Dundee, Nine Wells Hospital, Dundee

**EDINBURGH MEDICAL GROUP**  
Dr Brian Potter, EMG Project Office, 24 Buccleuch Place, Edinburgh EH8 9LN

**GLASGOW MEDICAL GROUP**  
Mr Sam Galbraith, Institute of Neurological Sciences, Southern General Hospital, Glasgow

**LEICESTER MEDICAL GROUP**  
Dr Liam Donaldson, Department of Community Health, Clinical Sciences Building, Leicester Royal Infirmary, PO Box 65, Leicester LE2 7LX

**LIVERPOOL MEDICAL GROUP**  
Dr Colin Powell, Department of Medicine, Royal Liverpool Hospital, Liverpool L7 8XP

**LONDON MEDICAL GROUP**  
Director of Studies, 68 Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG

**MANCHESTER MEDICAL GROUP**  
Dr Mary Lobjoit, Teaching Unit 4, University Hospital of South Manchester, Nell Lane, West Didsbury, Manchester M20 8LR

**NEWCASTLE MEDICAL GROUP**  
Dr Christopher Drinkwater, 14 Belle Grove Terrace, Newcastle-upon-Tyne NE2 4LL

**OXFORD MEDICAL FORUM**  
Dr James Falconer Smith, 20 Park Close, Bladon, Oxon OX7 1RN

**SHEFFIELD MEDICAL GROUP**  
Dr Martin Hayes-Allen, 183 Whitham Road, Broomhill, Sheffield S10 2SB

**SOUTHAMPTON MEDICAL GROUP**  
Dr Barbara Leppard, Department of Dermatology, Graham Road, Royal South Hants Hospital, Southampton

#### OFFICERS

##### **President**

The Rt Hon Lord Amulree

##### **Director of Studies**

Edward Shotter

##### **Scottish Director**

Kenneth Boyd

##### **Assistant Directors (Honorary)**

Brendan Callaghan, Raanan Gillon,

Dorian Haskard, Richard Nicholson

##### **Treasurer** Kenneth Darke

##### **Secretaries** Maureen Bannatyne,

Sheila Finnis, Susan French,

Helen Horton

#### GOVERNING BODY

##### **Lord Amulree** Chairman

*President, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics*

##### **R B Welbourn** Vice-Chairman

*Professor of Surgical Endocrinology,  
Royal Postgraduate Medical School*

##### **Margaret Auld**

*Chief Nursing Officer, Scottish  
Home and Health Department,  
Edinburgh*

##### **R D Catterall**

*Consultant Venereologist, Middlesex  
Hospital*

##### **Sir Cyril Clarke**

*Past President, Royal College of  
Physicians*

##### **Kenneth Darke**

*Senior Treasurer, ex officio*

##### **A S Duncan**

*Emeritus Professor of Medical Educa-  
tion, Edinburgh*

##### **G R Dunstan**

*Professor of Moral & Social Theology,  
King's College, London*

##### **C H Edwards**

*former Dean, St Mary's Hospital  
Medical School*

##### **C D Falconer**

*former Scottish Secretary, British  
Medical Association*

##### **C M Fletcher**

*Emeritus Professor of Clinical  
Epidemiology, University of London*

##### **T W Glenister**

*Dean, Charing Cross Hospital  
Medical School*

##### **Sir Brian Windeyer**

*former Vice-Chancellor, University  
of London*

##### **Lord Winstanley**

*General Practitioner, London*

##### **Patrick Magee**

*Westminster Medical School*

##### **Alan Schamroth**

*Middlesex Hospital Medical School*

##### **Ian Leonard**

*Guy's Hospital Medical School*

##### **Pamm Wiggan**

*Guy's Hospital Medical School*

##### **Edward Shotter**

*Director of Studies, ex officio*

# Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is an independent, non-partisan organisation for the multidisciplinary study of issues raised by the practice of medicine.

The Society aims to influence the quality of both professional and public discussion of medico-moral questions; to promote the study of medical ethics; to ensure a high academic standard for this developing subject; to encourage a multidisciplinary approach to discussion of the consequences of clinical practice; to stimulate research in specific problems; to remain non-partisan and independent of all interest groups and lobbies.

Since 1963 the London Medical Group, a student group for the study of issues raised by the practice of medicine, has arranged a series of lectures and symposia, now twice weekly throughout the academic year, in the 12 London teaching hospitals and medical schools.

In 1967 the Edinburgh Medical Group was established with similar aims, and subsequently medical groups have been formed in a majority of the British medical schools—currently Newcastle, Sheffield, Glasgow, Bristol, Birmingham, Manchester, Liverpool, Cardiff, Southampton, Aberdeen, Dundee, Cambridge, Oxford and Leicester.

In 1972 junior doctors, who had themselves been associated with the London Medical Group, founded the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics to develop these aims at a postgraduate level.

In 1975 research fellows were appointed by the Edinburgh Medical Group which established, in conjunction with the University of Edinburgh, a research project in medical ethics and education.

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is a registered educational charity and a Company Limited by Guarantee. It relies on voluntary grants and donations and is not supported from government sources.

There is no individual membership of the Society. Those interested in this work are invited to subscribe to the *Journal of medical ethics*. The lectures, symposia and conferences of the associated medical groups, although addressed primarily to medical, nursing and other students, are open to all those professionally interested. Details are published in the *Journal*.

#### **Society for the Study of Medical Ethics**

**Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London, WC1H 9LG.**

**Tel: 01-387 8132**